Teacher Recruitment and Salary: Regional Challenges and Reforms

Professor Gita Steiner-Khamsi, Columbia University, New York
Issue 1: Wasteful Recruitment into Teaching

Source: UNICEF CEECIS. (2011): Example Kyrgyzstan
Issue 2: Redistribution of Teaching Hours at School Level

- Measurement:
  Number of pedagogical specialists who teach subjects for which they have not been trained
  - For example, a math teacher who teaches chemistry.
  - PISA 2006, example Kyrgyzstan: 62% of schools report shortage in science and 59% of those schools fill vacancies with teachers that were not trained in science education.
### Issue 3: Low Teacher Salary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Average Base Salary, Local Currency</th>
<th>Average Base Salary, US Dollars</th>
<th>Average Total Pay, Local Currency</th>
<th>Average Total Pay, US Dollars</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Armenia</td>
<td>116,000 AMD</td>
<td>314 USD</td>
<td>81,591 AMD</td>
<td>221 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnia &amp; Herzegovina</td>
<td>691 BAM</td>
<td>498 USD</td>
<td>691 BAM</td>
<td>498 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia</td>
<td>19,300 MKD</td>
<td>448 USD</td>
<td>19,300 MKD</td>
<td>448 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>245 GEL</td>
<td>144 USD</td>
<td>307 GEL</td>
<td>181 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>1,441 KGS</td>
<td>30 USD</td>
<td>3,908 KGS</td>
<td>82 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moldova</td>
<td>2,200 MDL</td>
<td>184 USD</td>
<td>3,760 MDL</td>
<td>315 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>324,292 MNT</td>
<td>270 USD</td>
<td>374,727 MNT</td>
<td>299 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>88 TJS</td>
<td>20 USD</td>
<td>118 TJS</td>
<td>26 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>261,402 UZS</td>
<td>154 USD</td>
<td>329,940 USZ</td>
<td>195 USD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: UNESCO GMR Background Paper, 2009
Different Solutions for Different Systems: 2 Salary Systems in the Region

**Stavka System**
- Base Salary: 18-22 Hours of Teaching/Week
- Countries: Armenia, Kyrgyzstan, Moldova, Uzbekistan

**Workload System**
- Base Salary: 40 Hours of Work per Week
- Countries: Bosnia & Herzegovina, The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia
Flexible teaching hours

Paid by the teaching hour & everything else is paid in the form of supplements

Low base salary: Teachers are taking additional hours and/or have additional income

Stavka System

Either 20 hours or 40 hours

Unified salary: functions and tasks are defined and included in salary

Good salary: Teachers must focus on the job and are not allowed to take other work

Workload System
The Stavka System

Total Pay of Teacher

Base Salary

Salaries Depending on Teaching Load

Supplements
- Homeroom Teacher
- Grading Student Notebooks
- Supplement/Coefficient by Rank
- ETC: 3-12 Supplements

Allowances
- Transportation
- Housing
- Plot of Land/Garden
- Discount on Utilities etc.

Bonuses
- Annual (performance based)
- Event-specific (e.g., olympiads)
- Special occasions (Teachers Day, New Year, etc.)

Social Benefits
- Pension
- Sick leave, maternity leave
- Scholarships
- etc.

Other Income
- Private tutoring
- Fees for special classes
- Inofficial contributions by parents
Additional Teaching Hours by Location of School

Urban/Large Schools

Rural/Small Schools
Additional teaching hours benefit experienced/well networked teachers

### Total Monthly Income (in KGS)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Old Teacher</th>
<th>Young Teacher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class Teacher (15%)</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notebook Checking</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural Area Supplement</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Experience</td>
<td>1,311</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional Hours</td>
<td>2,403</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Base Salary (1 Stavka)</td>
<td>1,966</td>
<td>916</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Reform Initiatives in the Stavka System

Step-by-Step Reform

- Lift base salary
- Increase statutory teaching load
- Integrate and reduce number of supplements
- Enforce lower and upper limit of teaching load
- Introduce sizeable bonuses for high-performing teachers

Fundamental Reform

- Redefine teacher responsibilities (include pedagogical tasks and extra-curricular activities)
- Hire 2 types of teachers: full-time teachers (40 hours of work/week) or part-time teachers (20 hours of work/week)
- Prepare multi-subject teachers by means of pre-service teacher curriculum reofmr
- Double or triple the salary of teachers by
  - adopting the all-inclusive workload system
  - eliminating teaching loads that are less than 18 hours or more than 27 hours
  - hiring young specialists who fill the new positions
Bonuses for Good Performance

- Performance-Based Bonus
- Outcomes-based Contracts (formative evaluation of all students)
- Quarterly Performance Payments (for all civil servants)

Olympiads (traditional)
Promotion Criteria

**Traditional**
- Qualification
- Teaching Experience/Years

**Modified**
- Qualification
- Teaching Experience
- Rank by Function (regular teacher, methodologist, etc.)
- Performance